MAKKĪ AND GHAZĀLĪ ON MYSTICAL PRACTICES*

Kojiro Nakamura**

I

Abū Ţālib al-Makkī (d. 386 AH/996 AD) was a known Sūfī and a preacher nearly a century before Abū Ḥāmid al-Ghazālī (d. 505/1111). Makkī's name is particularly famous for the association of his Qūt al-qulūb with Ghazālī's Ihyā' 'ulūm al-dīn, as is suggested by many scholars. (1) This close relationship is all the more true as Ghazālī himself mentions Makkī's Qūt in his Munqidh at the top of the Sūfī works of his reading. (2) There is no doubt, therefore, about the fact that Ghazālī's Ihyā' is heavily indebted to Makkī's Qūt. However, as far as I know, no one has ever tried a close examination of the influence and clarified the similarities and dissimilarities between the two, except Prof. Lazarus-Yafeh who showed as an example the parallel passages in the first books of them. (2) In this paper I will give a brief comparison of the contents of the two works (Ihyā' and Qūt), and clarify Ghazālī's indebtedness to Makkī as well as his uniqueness with reference to the theory of wird.

п

As is well known, Ihpā' is divided into four quarters (rub'), each of which is further divided into ten books (kitāb). In the first Quarter, entitled "the Acts of Worship" ('Ibādāt), Ghazālī explains the meaning and significance of knowledge ('ilm), 'Ulamā', the orthodox dogmas in outline, and clarifies the external forms and merits of the acts of worship, such as Ablution (tahārah), Ritual Prayer (salāt), Fasting (sawm), and so on, with a particular emphasis of their inner meanings and mysteries. In the second, entitled "the Norms of Daily Life" ('Ādāt), Ghazālī deals with the norms and ethics in the rest of Muslim's daily activities needed for his mundane existence and devotion to God, such as eating, marriage,

This is the full paper presented at the 31st International Congress of Human Sciences in Asia and North Africa, Tokyo and Kyoto, 1983.

^{**} Associate Professor, Faculty of Letters, University of Tokyo.

companionship, seclusion, and so forth. In the third, entitled "the Ways to Perdition" (Muhlikāt), he investigates the essential and cosmological nature of man and his ordinary states, and clarifies his evil traits obstructive to his approach to God and salvation in the Hereafter, together with the methods of remedy and correction. In the fourth, entitled "the Ways to Salvation" (Munjivāt), Ghazālī describes the various states (ahwāl) and stages (maqāmāt) of man's spiritual development in his purgative way. In sum, Ihyā' is a comprehensive book for the science of mystical practices ('ilm al-mu'āmalah) logically arranged from a single point of view: How to make spiritual preparations for "seeing God" (ru'yah Allāh) or "meeting with God" (liqā' Allāh) in the Hereaster.

Makki's Qūt al-qulūb is essentially of the similar nature, dealing with the mystical practices. But the contents are not so systematically and well organized. The book is divided into 48 chapters, which may somehow be classified into several groups. The first 15 chapters and Chaps. 20-21 deal with various sorts of Şalāt and wird; the second group (Chaps. 16-20) with Qur'an-recitation; the third (Chaps. 23-30), with the soul (nafs), heart (qalb), and their control; the fourth (Chaps. 32, 38) with the Sūfī Maqāmāt from tawbah to maḥabbah; the fifth (Chaps. 22, 32-38) with the Five Pillars of Islam and the basic creeds; the sixth (Chaps. 39-42, 44-48) with the ethics of the daily activities. The remaining Chapter 31 discusses Knowledge and 'Ulama', and exactly corresponds in content to the first book of Ihyā'. After all, the first, second and fifth groups and Chapter 31 of Qut run roughly parallel with Quarter I of Ihya'; the fourth group with Quarter IV; the sixth with Quarter II; the third with part of Quarter III, that is, the first two books out of ten. The problems of the evil traits and their remedy discussed in the rest of Quarter III is neglected in Qut. The same is true with the subjects of the Spiritual Audition and Ecstasy (Book 18), the Enjoining Good and Forbidding Evil (Book 19), Meditation (Book 39), and the Remembrance of Death and the Hereafter (Book 40).

Furthermore, a single topic is often discussed in various places in Qul. For instance, Şalāt is discussed in Chaps. 9-12, 21, 33 (section 2), and 43; Fasting in Chaps 22, 33 (section 4). In contrast, when Ghazālī discusses a topic, say, Şalāt, he first presents the merits and sources by quoting from the Qur'an, the Sunnah and the early authorities. He then proceeds to explain the external, formal aspects of Şalāt and the inner meanings of it. This sort of systematic and well-organized presentation is characteristic of Ihyā', but not Qūt. Makkī fills the pages not infrequently solely with the quotations from the Qur'an, the Sunnah and the early authorities. He never embarks upon his own theoretical argument and interpretation except on rare occasions. His argument on islām and īmān in Chapter 35 is one of the rare cases.

As for the thought, there are many similar ideas and common terminologies in both Ihya' and Qut, such as the concepts of 'ilm al-zāhir and 'ilm al-bāṭin, 'ulamā' al-dunyā and 'ulamā' al-ākhirah, al-muqarrabūn and al-siddīqūn, īmān and yaqīn, khāṭir al-malak and khāṭir al-'adūw (or al-shaiṭān), etc. let alone the theory of Maqamat. It goes without saying, however, that Ghazali does not always follow the track laid by Makki. Nor does he simply elaborate and systematize the Makki's ideas. There are many differences and discrepancies between the two. For example, the concepts of 'alam al-mulk and 'alam al-malakut are found both in Ihyā', and Qūt, and in fact Ghazālī learned this two-fold cosmology from Makki's Oūt according to A. J. Wensinck.(4) In Ghazāli's cosmology, however, the mulk and the malakūt constitute the triad together with the jabarūt which is the intermediate world between the two, meaning "the world of the archetypal images."(4a) On the other hand, according to Makki, the world of jabarūt lies not between the worlds of mulk and malakūt, but rather above the world of malakūt.(8) Furthermore, Ghazālī not only differs from Makkī, but also he criticizes Makki in his Ihyā'. For example, on the question of islām and imān, Ghazālī refutes Makkī for the latter's identification of the two concepts and holding 'amal as an integral part of îmān.(6)

Ш

Now we turn to discuss the theory of wird in Ghazālī and Makkī. Generally the term wird is used in three different meanings; 1) the farigah, 2) a special prayer or litany, and 3) the "office" of the tariqah.(1) The wird under our consideration here is the third sense of the office of the tariqah, and this is what our two authors mean by the term, that is, the division of the daily hours into several parts (awrād) and allotment of the specific devotional practices to each of them. (8)

Ghazālī divides the daytime (about 12 hours) into seven wirds and the nighttime into five, and assigns to each of them the variously combined devotional acts, including what Ghazālī calls "the Four Practices" (al-wazā'if al-arba'ah).(9)

Wird I (from midnight to the last one-sixth of the night). This is the time for tahajjud prayer. To begin with, 1) du'ā' on awakening (du'ā' al-istīqāz); 2) du'ā' for changing clothes; 3) du'ā' for using the toilets; 4) dhikr and du'ā' Vol. XX 1984

for each process of wudu', and 5) for tahajjud.

Wird II (the last one-sixth of the night before dawn). This is the time for 1) light meal before dawn (sahūr) and 2) supplication for forgiveness (istighfār). Ghazālī gives the texts of dhikr and du'ā' for each process of meal and istighfār. He also recommends Qur'ān-recitation and Şalāt until dawn.

Wird III (from dawn to sunrise). This is the time for 1) salāt al-fajr, a supererogatory dawn prayer of two rak'ahs, and 2) salāt al-subh, the obligatory morning prayer. The texts of dhikr, du'ā' and Qur'ān-recitation are given for the whole processes of the Salāts and for walking to the Mosque.

Wird IV (from sunrise to mid-forenoon). Beside the Four Practices (dhikr, du'ā', qirā'ah and fikr), there are two additional duties in this wird. One is to do good to others by attending sick persons and funerals, to work in the way of piety and fear of God, and to attend lectures, and so on. The other is the mid-forenoon prayer (salāt al-duhā) of two, four, six, or eight rak'ahs when the sun is up in the sky.

Wird V (from mid-forenoon to noon). This is the time for earning a livelihood and taking a siesta in preparation for the night service. Earning should be limited to a minimum. If there is no work for livelihood, nor need of siesta, one must be engaged in Salāt and dhikr.

Wird VI (from noon to the noon-prayer). This is the shortest, but most meritorious of all wirds. 1) If one is already in the Mosque, after having completed ablution, he stays on and responds to the mu'adhdhin. Then he stands up and takes advantage of the special moment between adhān and iqāmah for the Ṣalāt of four rak'ahs, qirā'ah and du'ā'. 2) The obligatory noon-prayer (salāt al-zuhr). 3) Ṣalāt of two rak'ahs and then of four rak'ahs, during which some Sūrahs of the Qur'ān should be recited.

Wird VII (from the noon-prayer to mid-afternoon). 1) It is desirable to stay on in the Mosque engaged in Salāt, dhikr and other devotional activities, anticipating the next obligatory prayer. 2) Siesta is allowed for those who have not taken yet.

Wird VIII (from mid-afternoon prayer to the time when the sun turns yellow). This is the time for 1) Şalāt of four rak'ahs between adhān and iqāmah; 2) the obligatory mid-afternoon prayer (salāt al-'aṣr); 3) engagenent in the Four Practices. Particularly slow recitation of the Qur'ān is recommended, so that one can combine dhikr, fikr and du'a' with qirā'ah.

86

Wird IX (from the time when the sun turns yellow to sunset). The offices

ORIENT

are 1) tasbih and istighfār, and 2) qirā'ah before sunset. It is necessary to be engaged in supplication for forgiveness when the sun sets. Then 3) the obligatory sunset prayer (salāt al-maghrib), and 4) looking back upon one's deeds in the daytime.

Wird X (from sunset to the fall of darkness). 1) Şalāt of two rak'ahs immediately after the salāt al-maghrib, with the recitation of some parts of the Qur'ān in each rak'ah. 2) Another Şalāt of four rak'ahs. Then to stay engaged in Şalāt until the twilight disappears.

Wird XI (from nightfall to the time of sleep). 1) The obligatory night prayer (salāt al-'ishā'). 2) Şalāt of ten rak'ahs (four rak'ahs before the night prayer, six rak'ahs thereafter), reciting some parts of the Qur'ān. 3) Şalāt of 13 rak'ahs, reciting about 300 verses of the Qur'ān. 4) Şalāt of odd number (witr) of rak'ahs before sleep, if one ordinarily sits up till late at night for worship.

Wird XII (for sleep). 1) Ablution. 2) Expression of the intention to get up for worship if God wills. 3) Repentance of all sins. 4) Dhikr and $du^t\bar{a}$ before sleep. 5) Recitation of some special parts of the Qur'an. 6) Examination of one's heart with regard to what is then dominant in it.

This is the ideal pattern of the daily life for the Sūfī novice ('ābid). It is a kind of "monastic" rule. But it is not intended merely for the particular groups of Muslims. It is also for the ordinary Muslims who are mostly busy with their daily business. They need special rules in order to keep their mind fixed on God, precisely because of their occupation with worldly activities. Thus Ghazālī gives some variations of this basic pattern for people of different occupations⁽¹⁰⁾.

Makkī discusses the problem of wird in 11 chapters (Chaps. 2-8, 13-15, 20-21, and 24), which occupies almost one-fourth of Qūt, as far as the number of chapters is concerned. This shows how significant this problem is in Makkī's scheme of mystical practices. He first divides a day into 12 wirds exactly as Ghazālī does: the daytime into seven wirds and the nighttime into five. The length of time in each corresponding wird between Ghazālī and Makkī is almost the same with one exception. That is, Wird XII in Ghazālī's pattern is not counted as an independent wird by Makkī, who instead divides Ghazālī's Wird I into two. Furthermore, there are many common texs of dhikr and du'ā' both in Ihyā' and Qūt, which are to be used on the occasions of wudā' (Wird I), tahajjud (Wird I), meal (Wird III), after salāt al-fajr (Wird III), and salāt al-subh (Wird III), before sleep (Wirds XI, XII), and so on. Naturally there are many texts Vol. XX 1984

of dhikr and $du^i\bar{a}^i$ which are found in only one of the two. And Makki's description is rather loose, scattered, less elaborate, and not so easy to understand. In fact, there are in $Ihy\bar{a}^i$ many quotations of dhikr and $du^i\bar{a}^i$ which are not found in $Q\bar{u}t$. Perhaps these texts were in circulation as the Prophetic traditions. (11) In spite of all these discrepancies, no one can deny the influence of Makki's scheme of wird on Ghazālī's. So we may conclude that Ghazālī took from Makkī the idea and way of organizing the daily life with the specific offices of devotional practices for each part of it, unless there is evidence to the contrary. Moreover, Ghazālī not merely completed the scheme of wird, but gave it the theoretical justification in terms of the theory of dhikr and $du^i\bar{a}^i$.

IV

Behind Ghazālī's pattern of wird, there lies the theory of dhikr and $du'\bar{a}'$. The significance of wird in his theory cannot be fully appreciated without the understanding of his theory of dhikr and $du'\bar{a}'$. Since I have already analyzed this theory, (12) I will give a brief summary of it here. There are five different usages of the term dhikr in Ihyā', which are classified into two major groups: one is "mental dhikr" and the other is "vocal dhikr."

- Dhikr is an endeavor to keep the mind in constant remembrance of God, or a laborious effort to turn his concerns preoccupied with worldly things toward God by remembering Him constantly. Since it is hard to keep on remembering God all through daily life, there needs to be some technique or method.
- 2) Dhikr means a kind of "spiritual exercise," or meditation on one's own death, the torment in the tomb, the eschatological events and so on. This type of dhikr looks similar to the previous one, but the two are different as a method from each other: the first type leads to the higher state of dhikr (see below 4)), while the second produces a certain mood or sentiment in the heart of the novice such as fear, gratitude, or hope, and this mood in turn becomes a spur for more earnest engagement in the remembrance of God, and in other exercises as well. In this type of dhikr, the object of remembrance or meditation (madhkūr) is for the most part something other than God. (18)
- 3) Dhikr means repeated invocation of God's name or utterance of a sacred formula. In the Prophetic traditions the practice is recommended for its meritoriousness or "sacramental" nature in expiating one's sins. But

Ghazālī is more concerned with the special inner state induced in the heart of the Sūfī by its repeated utterance. It is essential, therefore, to pronounce the formula with the presence of the mind (hudūr al-qalb). To him the mental dhikr is more essential and cardinal than the vocal one, which is rather an auxiliary, yet important, method or "support" for the mental dhikr, since the vocal dhikr is more easily controlled by the human will than the mental one. (14)

It is, indeed, burdensome and requires constant effort to turn the mind to the practice of dhikr and keep on doing it. Nevertheless, as the formula is uttered repeatedly over a long period of time, with the mind in the remembrance of God, the practice of dhikr becomes in the end familiar and palatable to one's nature, and the initial hardship in it gradually disappears, and joy, sweetness, or love of it results instead. When familiarity (uns) with dhikr of God and love of it have taken firm root in the heart, man's thought and concern are cut off from all but God. The orientation of his whole personality is now totally reversed. This is the state of the usage 4) of dhikr. It is the inner state reached as a result of constant practice of dhikr, both mental and vocal, and other ascetic, devotional practices as well. It is the higher spiritual state in which a man is solely bent on God and his mind is completely submerged in the thought of God.

5) Dhikr is the most intensified method of repeating incessantly the name of God (Allāh) or a simple phrase like Subhāna 'llāh (Glory be to God!), in the small dark corner of zāwiyah, without being disturbed by any other thoughts and practices whatsoever. In this process the mind of the Sūfī gradually becomes concentrated and recollected upon the word of dhikr and what is expressed by it, and he passes to the state of ecstasy (fanā'), with God's favor. This is the goal of the Sūfī way in this world. There is no more need of dhikr at this point than there is no need of the guide once the destination is reached. For dhikr presupposes the subject (dhākir) and its object (madhkūr), and when this disparity disappears, there is no dhikr any more.

As for $du'\bar{a}'$ (supplication), Ghazālī's notion of it is traditional, rather than mystical, in the sense that it is no more than the original Qur'anic meaning of supplication. But his interest in $du'\bar{a}'$ is rather practical. He is more concerned with the benefit $(f\bar{a}'idah)$ of $du'\bar{a}'$ as a practical method in the Sūfī way rather than a supplication as such, or "a spontaneous manifestation of emotion." First of all, $du'\bar{a}'$ requires the presence of the mind, which is the apex of all acts of worship. Man's mind usually does not turn to the remembrance of God unless there

is need or suffering from calamity and misfortune. Need brings $du^i\bar{a}^i$, which in turn brings the mind back to God. $Du^i\bar{a}^i$ not only brings the mind back to the remembrance of God, but also gives to it humility $(tadarru^i)$ and submissiveness $(khush\bar{u}^i)$ to God. In addition to this inner attitude of humbleness, Ghazālī mentions as the conditions of the suppliant longing (raghbah), fear (rahbah), unconditionality in supplication, sincere hope of God's response, purity of the heart and repentance of sins. All these conditions express man's self-denial, creatureliness $('ub\bar{u}diyah)$, impotence as well as God's all-powerfulness, lordliness and majesty, and consequently man's complete surrender to, and dependence upon, Him.

It is difficult, however, in the beginning to fulfil all these inner conditions at each $du'\bar{a}'$. Nevertheless, the novice can overcome this intial difficulty and thus appropriate the inner qualities expressed in those conditions by repeated practice. In so doing these qualities gradually becomes his second nature, and thus he converts the dogmatic teaching of tawhid into truly interiorized traits and thought. If $du'\bar{a}'$ is so vital to the inner life of the human heart, it is best to make $du'\bar{a}'$ as often as possible on every occasion in the daily life, without waiting for need, calamity, or ill luck. Man may make supplication for future happiness both in this world and the next, as well as for deliverance from the present calamity and sin. Since man is all mortal and weak, there is enough reason for him to make $du'\bar{a}'$ at every moment. (14)

The best way to keep remembering God is to organize and regulate the daily life with the practices of dhikr and du'ā', in combination with qirā'ah and fikr (discursive meditation), in order to avert boredom (malāl) which comes from the simple repetition of the same act. Ghazālī's pattern of wird is a concrete elaboration of this theory. This theoretical background of wird is Ghazālī's uniqueness in comparison with Makkī, who rather simply emphasizes the traditional merits of those practices.

Notes

- (4) A. J. Wensinck, "On the Relation between Ghazali's Cosmology and His Mysticism." Mededeelingen der Koninklijke Akademie van Wetenschappen, Afdeeling Letter Kunde, Ser. A, LXXV (1933), 191-92.
- (4a) L. Gardet, "'Alam," El3, I, 351. But I cannot completey agree to this interpretation.
- (5) al-Makki, Qūt al-qulūb (2 vols. Cairo: Matba'ah Muştafā al-Bābī al-Halabī, 1961), I, 498. See also Wensinck, ibid., 192.
- (6) al-Makki, Qūt, I, 117.
- (7) J. S. Trimingham, The Sufi Orders in Islam (London: Oxford University Press, Paperback ed., 1973), 214.
- (8) According to Makkī, Anas b. Sīrīn had seven wirds every night and made up in the daytime for anything he had missed during the night, and called the appointed office (al-'amal al-muwazzaf al-muwaqqat) as wird. And also al-Mu'tamir b. Sulaimān called a part (hizb) of the Qur'ān for a certain appointed time as wird, and he said that some devotees used to make wirds out of the parts (ajzā') of the Qur'ān, and some out of several rukū's, and that above these the knowers ('ulamā') used to make the wirds out of the hours of the day and night. The division of the hours, Makkī says, with the accompanyment of the Qur'ānic verses, rak'ahs, meditations (fikrah), or shahādah that was the wird of al-Mu'tamid (Qūt, 1, 168).

These reports tell us three points. First, the wird originally seems to have been a devotional practice performed at night. Second, the wird used to mean the various devotional practices, and then came to mean the division of the hours including the practices. Third, the way of division of a day differed from person to person.

- (9) Ghazālī mainly deals with the problem of wird in Ihyā' (4 vols. Cairo: Maṭba'ah Muṣṭafā al-Bābī al-Ḥalabī, n. d.), I, 333-67 (Kitāb Tartīb al-Awrād wa-Tafṣīl Ihyā' al-Lail).
 - (10) Ihya', I, 353-56.

This is very significant since it clearly shows a sort of popularization of Sūfism. Gharālī expected every Muslim to participate in the Sūfi practices in some way or other.

- (11) In fact, the title of Chapter 5, Book 9 (Kitāb al-Adhkār wa'l-Da'awāt) of *Ihyā*' runs as follows: "Prayers transmitted from the Prophet and his Companions, with the *isnād* omitted and chosen from the collections of Abū 'Ţālib al-Makkī, Ibn Khuzaimah and Ibn Mundhir."
- (12) For more details, see my Ph. D. dissertation presented to Harvard University, 1970, entitled "Al-Ghazāli"s Idea of Prayer, with an English Translation and Annotations of 'Kitāb al-Adhkār wa'l-Da'awāt' of His Ihyā' 'Ulām al-Dīn,'' and also my Ghazali on Prayer (The Institute of Oriental Culture, The University of Tokyo, 1973); "A Structural Analysis of Dhikr and Nembutsu," Orient, VII (1971), 75-96. This topic is discussed mainly in Book 9, Quarter I, entitled "Kitāb al-Adhkār," Ihyā', I, 295-333.
- (13) The practice of meditation becomes more effective when it is repeated regularly. To be sure, this idea of repetition is also included in the connotations of dhikr (or tadhakkur). It purports not only to remember a certain idea, but also to establish it in the mind repeating the remembrance of it, in contrast with fikr (discursive meditation), another meditative exercise, which means to produce a new idea or knowledge by combining the two known different ones.
- (14) This idea of primacy of meditative aspect is also implied when the practice of dhikr is methodically and systematically organized in combination with other similar services (du'a', qira'ah and fikr), thus constituting the Four Practices. By observing all these services in turn, the Sūfi novice keeps his mind in constant remembrance of God.
 - (15) F. Heiler, Das Gebet (Munich: C. Brügel & Sohn, 19238), 352.
- (16) So Ghazāli mentions dhikr-formulas and du'ā'-texts for such various occasions as travelling (Ihyā', II, 243-302 [K. Salar]), marriage (Ihyā', II, 21-62 [K. Nikāḥ]), funeral (Ihyā', I, 205 [K. Ṣalāt]), drought (Ihyā', I, 204-205 [K. Ṣalāt]), the eclipse of the sun and the moon (Ihyā', I, 204), rain, thunder, wind, physical pain, anger, fear of people, grief, and others. Thus every moment of daily life is punctuated by the practice of dhikr and du'ā'.

90

⁽¹⁾ L. Massignon, "Abū Țălib al-Makki," Encyclopaedia of Islam (2nd ed.), I, 153; F. Sezgin, Geschichte des arabischen Schriftums (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1967—), I, 667; A. Schimmel, Mystical Dimensions of Islam (Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 1975), pp. 25, 120, and others.

⁽²⁾ W. M. Watt (tr.), The Faith and Practice of al-Ghazali (London: George Allen & Unwin, 1953). 54.

⁽³⁾ H. Lazarus-Yafeh, Studies in al-Ghazzali (Jerusalem: The Magnes Press, 1975), 34-35.